Interactive comment on “I-WARP: individual water main renewal planner” by Y. Kleiner and B. Rajani

R. Beuken (Referee)
ralph.beuken@kwrwater.nl

Received and published: 24 March 2010

I would like to thank the authors for their excellent and useful article and would post some remarks.

The article describes clearly the structure of I-WARP and its application in a case-study in a Western Canadian town. A number of covariates used in I-WARP are meaningful for this case, i.e. cast iron mains, severe freezing and the use of retrofit cathodic protection. 1. I suggest you expand on the use of I-WARP in different circumstances, like other pipe materials or climate conditions. An outline could be given of a general structure on how to apply the model in various situations and how to select suitable covariates?

I have another question that is posted by Mr Sagrov as well and is related to the homogeneity of the applied mains group, the large set of breakage data and the quality
of the obtained result of the model. 2. I suggest you expand on the data requirements of the model, i.e. what quality of data is required in order to obtain a reliable outcome. Perhaps you could refer to the application of the model in other case-studies.